## LIMITATIONS

The following limitations should be taken into consideration when reviewing the assessment findings:

- 1. **Quantitative Data**. A wide range of data was included in this report, with data sets from the 2010 Census, American Community Survey, Ohio Department of Education, Cleveland Heights Police Department, and NEO CANDO integrated data system. On many occasions, data sets were compared to illustrate trends for the various topics outlined in the assessment. For more recent years, American Community Survey datasets were used. These data sets use a small sample of the population to make estimates and project yearly numbers/counts (U.S. Census Bureau, 2015). Though these datasets are for the most part reliable, their margin of error should be considered in all projections.
- 2. **Qualitative Data**. Many of the interviews were conducted with residents and stakeholders that were accessed and recruited via the Noble Neighbors group. Students were able to identify stakeholders and possible interviewees outside of the Noble Neighbors group through web-search (for example, Cleveland Heights-University Heights PTA members were identified through individual schools' websites). Though outreach was done to a wide range of residents and stakeholders, much of the qualitative data represents a small sample of the Noble neighborhood. Qualitative data may be skewed towards residents who are more active and who regularly attend Noble Neighbors community meetings. This means that interviews may not have captured oppositional viewpoints or opinions of residents who are not as actively involved in neighborhood affairs. Finally, interviews may not be representative of all residents of the neighborhood (residents of all ages, races, socioeconomic statuses, etc.).
- **3.** Assessment Timeframe. Students completed their case files and participated in neighborhood surveying between February and April, with final case files submitted in May 2015. Much of the survey data was collected during this time, with some follow-up surveying occurring during the summer (this allowed for some spot-checking and data cleaning). Since this assessment took place in conjunction with a Spring semester graduate course, students were limited to this time frame to complete their case files. Thus, the assessment was limited in the amount of time students had to complete their research.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

Through interviews with key stakeholders, quantitative data findings, and literature providing insight into the Noble neighborhood, a list of recommendations was created that reflects the needs and desires of stakeholders. This assessment suggests that the following actions be considered in revitalization and community-building efforts in order to address housing, business, crime, and youth-related issues:

### **Housing Recommendations**

1. **Noble Neighbors must engage other stakeholders to include them in shaping a consensus vision for the neighborhood.** We believe that the most critical action for the Noble Neighbors is to begin to engage with other stakeholders and voices not yet heard. We have uncovered three key tensions in this organization, and it is likely that others would be revealed with further investigation. The Noble Neighbors leadership should take steps to surface these tensions to either resolve them or find ways to keep them in productive balance.

Moreover, the face of a typical resident of Noble neighborhood—a younger, lower-income African American renter—does not match the face of the Noble Neighbor's average member—an older, middle-income, White homeowner. There is a widespread belief among the Noble Neighbors we interviewed that renters have little investment in their community. We have also detected both conscious and unconscious racial bias in our interviews. We strongly recommend that the Noble Neighbors take immediate steps to identify representatives who can tell the stories of populations in this community who are under-or unrepresented in the organization.

It must be explicitly stated that we believe that the Noble Neighbors organization does not intend to pursue an agenda that is consistent with historical racist practices, such as redlining, that would force out African American residents. On the contrary, we have heard and accept at face value the pride in diversity espoused by the organization's mission statement. Yet, we believe it is our duty as researchers to highlight the danger of unconsciously undermining African American residents' access to quality housing by trying to raise housing values beyond the reach of the majority of the community's residents.

- 2. The many stories of this neighborhood could be a powerful tool to combat negative media representations. If Professor Chupp is right in saying that Noble neighborhood faces a "story problem," then the best way to push back against negative perceptions is to tell a more positive story. Doing so will first require the Noble Neighbors to establish relationships among the many communities that live there, including renters, refugees, diverse ethnicities, business owners, and young and old residents. Diversity must be seen as an act rather than a status, something that must be built and sustained through honest speaking and open listening rather than an asset to be advertised. Indeed, until diversity is actively pursued as an ideal, it will remain more of a hindrance than an asset.
- 3. Community-building efforts will not come from outside; the Noble Neighbors are best positioned to start involving the whole community in these efforts. Members of the Noble Neighbors repeatedly told us that they miss the sense of community they used to feel or that they heard once existed in this neighborhood. When we interviewed individuals who were not residents or members of the organization, each of them told us that that sense of

community has to come from the efforts of residents themselves. We believe that this statement is so important that it deserves to be highlighted as one of our recommendations to the Noble Neighbors, particularly because past efforts have been unsuccessful. We heard about events such as ice cream socials, litter pick-up, and "foreclosure walks," but we believe that such events have do not appeal to all residents. Instead, we recommend that Noble Neighbors spend more time learning about their neighbors to begin building relationships with underrepresented groups and to discover what kinds of events would appeal to their fellow residents.

4. The wealth of historical knowledge in this community could be leveraged to deepen new residents' commitment to the neighborhood. We heard from all the members of Noble Neighbors who we interviewed that they are dismayed with newer residents' and renters' lack of engagement with and investment in their neighborhood. We believe that this may be ameliorated by leveraging the huge wealth of historical knowledge found across this neighborhood. One concrete suggestion would be to research the history of apartments and vacant homes, their block, and other interesting details of a particular property or subneighborhood's history. This research could be compiled and presented to residents when they move in, so that they are made aware that they are members not only of a geographic community, but also a community with deep historical roots. Moreover, creating a shared history of one's home and neighborhood can lead to a sense of common cause and a more profound relationship with one's neighbors. It may also bridge the notable gap between long-term residents who express regret at the loss of better days, short-term residents who will likely move on after a few years, and new residents who are just starting a new life as a member of the community in the Noble neighborhood.

#### Youth and Education Recommendations

- 1. **Inquire further into the disparity in CH-UH school performance.** Why are some schools failing while others in the District are not?
  - Further research is need to determine what can be done to improve the performance of failing schools in the Noble neighborhood.
  - Provide more resources to schools with need. For example, a preschool is needed at Oxford Elementary, where some of the students with greatest need attend.
- 2. The cooperation between the public schools and community organizations needs to continue and be strengthened.
- 3. Additional incentives are needed to promote staying in the neighborhood and public schools. Further exploration is needed to determine what would motivate increased parent and neighbor involvement in schools and community.
- 4. Increase green spaces and playgrounds for children, youth and adults in the neighborhood.
- 5. **Increase awareness of and access to community programs and supports.** Cleveland Heights has numerous public and nonprofit programs and services for children and families. Specifically, newer residents who move into the neighborhood are less aware of these opportunities.

- 6. **Ensure that students are ready to learn and on the path to becoming active community members.** In some cases, this means providing adequate food, clothing, and health services that can also be a means to engage other members of the community.
- 7. Empower families and youth in the Noble neighborhood.
  - What does the neighborhood want to see happen with Noble Elementary?
  - o If Noble Elementary closes, how can residents ensure their ideas for the building are taken into account?
  - How can various systems support and strengthen each other?

#### **Business and Retail Recommendations**

After collecting and analyzing quantitative and qualitative data, we would like to propose several recommendations for the next steps in the assessment, engagement, and intervention process. Because this project focused only on assessment and engagement, and not intervention, our recommendations include opportunities for business leaders and residents of the Noble neighborhood to interact in ways that may facilitate change.

- 1. Businesses need to be more involved with the community. That is also the very basic character of the CBE theory. We discovered a disconnect between business owners and residents when we were completing our stakeholder interviews; residents were only familiar with the businesses they considered "assets" and were often unaware of the myriad purposes that different businesses serve in the community. And to unify and solidify current businesses, we propose the formation of merchant groups. As stated before, having a merchants group would give both business owners and residents an opportunity to come together to discover the needs of each group. This would empower residents to speak to the collective business district and thereby address concerns, share ideas, give praise, etc, and allow businesses to do the same.
- 2. Increase gathering places (youth-friendly included) to foster a greater sense of community and may contribute to lower incidences of crime. As previously addressed with children and youth, a major theme in our resident interviews was the issue of delinquent youth. Many Noble neighborhood residents spoke of their concern with crimes committed by children and teenagers, particularly young males, and they cited these youth as a major business deterrent. Instead of focusing on heavier policing (which may have its benefits), we propose that the Noble neighborhood work to create more youth-friendly gathering spots or businesses. For example, one resident spoke of an ice cream shop that was open on Noble Road many years ago, and mentioned that the children of the neighborhood would "hang out there after school." She stated that crime was lower at that time because "the kids had something to do." Working with businesses to create more youth-friendly environments or adding spaces for youth to go after school or on the weekends not only strengthens the community, but may have effects on crime as well.

Many of the residents spoke of their desire for a warm, inviting coffee shop or restaurant where they could sit down with friends and family and feel safe. Several individuals mentioned The Stone Oven on Lee Road as an example of the type of environment they would like this café or restaurant to have. The words "warm," 'bright," "inviting," and "safe" were frequently heard when residents were asked what they look for in a business. If there

were more gathering places with this type of desired environment, we feel that residents would be more likely to gather in their own neighborhood rather than driving to Lee Road or other business districts to fulfill their needs. And again, when residents remain in their community to shop, play, and gather, a stronger community results.

- 3. Attract a grocery store to locate in the neighborhood. Another major theme of resident interviews was the lack of a major grocery store in the area. Many residents mentioned that they complete their grocery shopping at Severance Town Center because the only business with groceries in their neighborhood is the CVS at the corner of Noble Road and Monticello Road. Upon further investigation, however, we discovered that there is a Save-A-Lot grocery store in the neighborhood, as well. We found it interesting that only one resident mentioned this grocery store; all others stated that the CVS was the only business to buy groceries. When a neighborhood lacks a resource as vital as a reliable grocery store, it creates an environment of outsourcing. Residents stated that they often travel to Severance Town Center for their groceries, and while out, tend to complete their other consumer needs. If residents are accustomed to constantly traveling for something as basic and necessary as groceries, it may explain why local businesses are struggling. Residents do not see their neighborhood as one with the resources they need, so they travel elsewhere. Although establishing a grocery store is a major endeavor and one that might not be feasible given the close proximity of Severance, we believe that the presence of one may help residents to feel like their neighborhood has more of the assets and resources that they need and desire.
- 4. **Work with the city to clean up the Mayfield/Warrensville/Noble triangle.** Residents have highlighted that they see potential use for the land where the city is housing a large pile of dirt. It also is adjacent to a large green space with a building of office spaces for lease. That property may become more attractive to potential buyers is the dirt pile is removed. We recommend that residents work with the city of Cleveland Heights to share their concerns about the location and advocate for themselves to show the city the potential they believe the location holds.
- 5. **Boost community pride.** This could be accomplished (or at least initiated) by improving the external appearance of businesses. While a major renovation may not be fiscally possible for many of the area businesses, residents could come together for a "clean up day," and could pick up trash, pull weeds, or place flower boxes to make simple improvements to exterior appearances. Not only would businesses benefit from the improvements, but residents would have the opportunity to meet the business owners, making connections and forming relationships that will ideally foster a stronger sense of community. For businesses with more fiscal power, they might participate in the Storefront Renovation Program, which also assists businesses in improving the external appearance of their buildings.

The Noble neighborhood has several assets in their business community. We propose by working to connect existing businesses with the community and strengthen the bond between residents and businesses, the Noble neighborhood can meet the recommendations of the Business/Retail Task Group and see improved outcomes in their community. Businesses in this neighborhood succeed when they are connected to the community, and the community succeeds when businesses are connected to the needs to the people.

## Safety Recommendations

Based on input from key stakeholders and our group's assessment of the Noble neighborhood, we present a few recommendations for the community to consider as they move toward positive change related to the safety of the neighborhood. Furthermore, our recommendations are based on social disorganization theory. According to the theory, it is the repeated interactions among residents that generate social trust. Mediating factors that have been empirically proven to explain the relationship between social disorganization and violence are social cohesion, trust and informal social control. Therefore, we believe that the community's revitalization must incorporate all residents, including youth. It is pertinent to the revitalization of the community that they begin to break down social barriers that impede their renewal. Social trust has been proven to deter crime from entering a neighborhood. Therefore, we believe that it is through social trust that residents will be empowered to make their community a safe environment for all.

## 1. Improve resident/police relationships.

- a. This might be achieved through continual growth of the Meet Your Police events to reach out to neighbors and build connections
- b. There is potential for development of a neighborhood watch program
- c. Clearly identify the roles and responsibilities of both residents and police with regards to crime monitoring and reporting
- 2. **Develop, grow, and improve youth programs and engagement.** Giving youth meaningful opportunities to get involved will help to reduce the number of unsupervised youth who may be at risk for committing crimes.

## 3. Build trust between residents in the community.

- a. Implement community activities that bring residents together such as block clubs and/or parties, community gardens, and walking clubs
- b. Build community locations or gathering spaces where all residents can come together.
- 4. **Integrate all residents into the neighborhood organization**. Building the Noble Neighbors to welcome residents of every type will help to include members of different races, classes, genders, and so forth. This is critical to ensure that decisions are being made to benefit the community as a whole.

#### 5. Educate residents.

- a. Empower residents by teaching them how to look-up crime reports on the Cleveland Heights Police website
- b. Increase awareness of safety issues specific to the neighborhood through educational talks and safety tips that are communicated to all residents.
- c. Learn how to appropriately respond to safety concerns, including when and how to report crimes.
  - Improve access to services and educate residents on what types of supports the community has with regards to safety (e.g. rape test kits, crisis lines, neighborhood watch)
- 6. **Bring additional services to the community.** Discuss with residents what other services they feel might improve the safety of their neighborhood; work with appropriate leaders to bring those services into the community.

## REFERENCES

- Ohio Department of Education. (2014). FY2014 District Profile Report. Retrieved from: http://education.ohio.gov/Topics/Finance-and-Funding/Finance-Related-Data/District-Profile-Reports/FY2014-District-Profile-Report
- RTA System Map. (2015). Retrieved from: http://www.riderta.com/sites/default/files/pdf/maps/System\_Map\_Main.pdf
- U.S. Census Bureau. (2015). *What is the American Community Survey?* Retrieved from: https://www.census.gov/programs-surveys/acs/about.html

# **APPENDIX**

# APPENDIX A. DEMOGRAPHIC DATA FOR CLEVELAND HEIGHTS AND NOBLE NEIGHBORHOOD (OVERALL AND CENSUS TRACT).

	Cleveland Heights	Noble Neighborhood	Census Tract 1401.0	Census Tract 1403.01	Census Tract 1403.02	Census Tract 1404.0	Census Tract 1405.0
Total Population	46,121	12,500	1,538	2,279	2,357	3,017	3,309
Males	46.6%	45.2%	44.9%	44.1%	45.7%	45.4%	45.5%
Females	53.4%	54.8%	55.1%	55.9%	54.3%	54.6%	54.5%
Race, White	49.8%	27.1%	13.7%	4.3%	32.7%	38.5%	34.7%
Race, Black	42.5%	67.8%	82.4%	93.1%	62.8%	55.6%	58.3%
Race, Hispanic	1.9%	1.6%	1.2%	1.1%	1.9%	1.5%	1.9%
Race, Asian/Pacific Islander	4.1%	1.7%	0.5%	0.5%	1.5%	1.5%	3.2%
Race, Other	3.5%	3.4%	3.4%	2.0%	2.9%	4.1%	3.8%
Number of Households (Total)	19,957	5,338	628	924	1,054	1,305	1,427
Family Households	54.3%	61.9%	66.4%	68.8%	58.2%	60.3%	59.7%
Non-Family Households	45.7%	38.1%	33.6%	31.2%	41.8%	39.7%	40.3%
Housing Units (Total)	22,465	6,049	695	1,096	1,187	1,466	1,605

Occupied Housing Units	88.8%	88.2%	90.8%	84.3%	88.8%	89.0%	88.9%
Vacant Housing Units	11.2%	11.8%	9.2%	15.7%	11.2%	11.0%	11.1%
Owner-occupied Housing Unit	56.3%	66.4%	75.5%	65.2%	68.8%	66.9%	60.8%
Renter-occupied Housing Unit	43.7%	33.6%	24.5%	34.8%	31.2%	33.1%	39.2%

Note: Data from 2010 Census, retrieved from Neocando 2010+ system (2014)

APPENDIX B. EDUCATION, EMPLOYMENT, AND POVERTY DATA FOR CLEVELAND HEIGHTS AND NOBLE NEIGHBORHOOD (OVERALL AND CENSUS TRACT).

	Cleveland Heights	Noble Neighborhood	Census Tract 1401.0	Census Tract 1403.01	Census Tract 1403.02	Census Tract 1404.0	Census Tract 1405.0
Poverty Rate	19.1%	16.5%	16.3%	16.6%	18.6%	9.7%	21.2%
Child Poverty Rate	27.8%	31.3%	32.1%	45.7%	40.4%	5.5%	32.6%
Median household income	\$48,717	\$47,808	\$43,272	\$47,074	\$49,392	\$52,396	\$46,905
Median family income	\$66,581	\$61,162	\$57,361	\$52,943	\$63,636	\$78,257	\$53,614
Poverty rate	19.1%	16.5%	16.3%	16.6%	18.6%	9.7%	21.2%
Child poverty rate	27.8%	31.2%	32.1%	45.7%	40.3%	5.5%	32.6%
Household received food stamps, past year	11.5%	14.4%	16.4%	13.6%	19.3%	5.9%	18.4%
Persons with high school degree	5,330	2,038	214	502	534	331	457
Students enrolled in public school	4,982	1,876	296	371	284	379	546
Students enrolled in private school	2,053	183	0	59	0	99	25
Males employed	10,895	2,879	339	447	590	796	707
Females employed	12,069	3,794	394	811	623	973	993

Note: Data from American Community Survey (2006-2010) 5-year estimate, retrieved from Neocando 2010+ system (2014)

CRIME TYPE	TOTAL OCCURRENCES	VIOLENT	NON-VIOLENT	NON- AGGRAVATED	PART 1	PART 2
AGGRAVATED ASSAULT	1	X			X	
AGGRAVATED BURGLARY	13	X			X	
AGGRAVATED ROBBERY	29	X			X	
AGGRAVATED MENACING	37			X	X	
ARSON	5		X		X	
ASSAULT (FREE TEXT)	23	X				X
BREAKING AND ENTERING	179		X		X	
BURGLARY	147		X		X	
CARRY CONCEALED WEAPON (FELONY)	5					X
CRIMINAL DAMAGE OR ENDANGERING	24			X		X
CRIMINAL MISCHIEF	100					X
CRIMINAL TRESPASS	86		X			X

DAMAGE TO AUTO	84		X		X	
DAMAGE TO PROPERTY (FREE TEXT)	29				X	
DAMAGE TO PROPERTY/PRIVATE	57		X		X	
DAMAGE TO PROPERTY- CITY/PUBLIC	22		X		X	
DISORDERLY CONDUCT	93					X
DISTURBANCE- UNWANTED GUEST	5					X
DOMESTIC VIOLENCE	116		X			X
DRUG PARAPHERNALIA POSSESS	28		X			X
FELONY ASSAULT	20	X			X	
FORGERY	4					X
FRAUD (FREE TEXT)	42					X
FRAUD IDENTITY/THEFT OF IDENTITY	50					X
GRAND THEFT	5				X	
HOMICIDE (FREE TEXT)	1	X			X	
KIDNAP ADULT	5			x		X

KIDNAP MINOR	2			X		x
KIDNAPPING (FREE TEXT)	1			X		X
LIQUOR POSSESS- UNDERAGE PROHIBITIONS	4					X
LIQUOR- UNDERAGE POSSESSION OR CONSUMPTION	2					X
MENACING	47			X		X
MENACING BY STALKING	3			X		X
POSSESSION DRUG ABUSE INSTRUMENTS	6		X			X
POSSESSION OF DRUGS	107		X			X
RAPE	5	X			X	
ROBBERY	29	X			X	
SEX OFFENSES	1	X			X	
SEX OFFENSES (FREE TEXT)	5	X			X	
SUSPICION	84		X			X
SUSPICIOUS PERSON	14		X			X

SUSPICIOUS VEHICLE	7	X		X
THEFT (FREE TEXT)	165	X	X	
THEFT FROM AUTO	132	X	X	
THEFT FROM AUTO/UNLOCKED	17	X	X	
THEFT OF MOTOR VEHICLE	40	X	X	
THEFT OTHER	1	X	X	
THEFT/BICYCLE	26	X	X	
THEFT/CREDIT CARDS	2	X	X	
THEFT/FIREARM OR DANGEROUS ORDNANCE	7	X	X	
THEFT/FROM BUILDING	2	X	X	
THEFT/FROM MAIL	5	X	X	
THEFT/LICENSE PLATE	20	X	X	
THEFT/PARTS FROM VEHICLE	2	X	X	
THEFT/SHOPLIFTING	32	X	X	
THEFT/FROM COIN MACHINE	1	X	X	

TRAFFICKING IN DRUGS	13					X
VANDALISM	17			X		X
WEAPON OFFENSE (FREE TEXT)	3					X
TOTALS	2,012	127	1,277	254	1,125	887

Data provided by the Cleveland Heights Police Department

				2013-2014 School Year													
	Subarou	Test		Readi	ing			Mathem	atics			А	II Tests				
	p	Grad e	Studen t#	Gain	Std Error	Gain Inde x	Studen t #	Gain	Std Error	Gain Inde x	Studen t#	Gain	Std Error	Gain Inde x	Grade / Ratin g		
		All Grade s	295	0.8196	0.698 0	-1.17	295	4.0708	0.612 8	-6.64		- 2.4452	0.507 7	-4.81	F		
	Overall	4th Grade	152	- 1.4862	1.159 7	-1.28	152	- 7.1257	1.032 4	-6.90		- 4.3059	0.838 2	-5.13			
Gearity		5th Grade	143	0.1530	1.185 7	-0.12	143	1.0159	0.979 2	-1.03		- 0.5845	0.833 4	-0.70			
Professional Developme nt School	Students w/ Disabilitie s	All Grade s	31	- 4.8511	2.192 1	-2.21	31	- 8.5509	1.879 6	-4.54		- 6.7010	1.580 4	-4.23	F		
	Lowest 20%	All Grade s	72	- 0.6734	1.501 6	-0.44	79	- 4.3790	1.247 1	-3.51		- 2.5262	1.061 7	-2.37	F		
	Gifted	All Grade s	27	0.2617	2.385 2	0.11	28	- 2.5324	2.034 9	-1.24		- 1.1354	1.719 5	-0.66	С		
		Overall	All Grade s	299	0.8076	0.686 9	1.18	299	4.2061	0.606 3	-6.93		1.6993	0.501 1	-3.39	F	
	Overall	4th Grade	144	2.1798	1.204	1.81	145	5.8804	1.067	-5.50		1.8503	0.869	-2.12			
Davidavand		5th Grade	155	0.5646	1.126 1	-0.50	154	2.5319	0.930 9	-2.71		1.5482	0.791 5	-1.95			
Boulevard Elementary School	Students w/ Disabilitie s	All Grade s	24	0.6840	2.444 6	0.28	24	- 2.6768	2.121 9	-1.26		- 0.9964	1.773 1	-0.56	С		
	Lowest 20%	All Grade s	77	0.1630	1.406 0	0.12	92	2.9066	1.138 1	-2.55		1.3718	0.985 2	-1.39	D		
	Gifted	All Grade s	35	2.2913	2.195 8	-1.04	37	0.4007	1.864 8	0.21		0.9453	1.565 3	-0.60	С		
		All Grade s	345	2.6285	0.636 7	4.13	345	2.4069	0.560 9	4.29		2.5177	0.464 7	5.42	А		
Canterbury Elementary	Overall	4th Grade	175	0.0357	1.091	0.03	175	0.8785	0.970	-0.90		0.4214	0.789	-0.53			
School		5th Grade	170	5.2214	1.077	4.85	170	5.6923	0.889	6.40		5.4569	0.757	7.21			
	Students w/	All Grade	36	2.5085	2.129 0	1.18	36	2.8318	1.875 0	1.51		2.6702	1.554 6	1.72	В		

	Disabilitie s	S												
	Lowest 20%	All Grade s	56	1.6787	1.705 8	0.98	51	3.3153	1.572 9	2.11	 2.4970	1.262 7	1.98	В
	Gifted	All Grade s	31	2.9404	2.150 1	1.37	37	2.8106	1.822 6	1.54	 2.8662	1.508 1	1.90	В
		All Grade s	348	0.7053	0.634 4	1.11	348	0.5277	0.560 8	0.94	 0.6165	0.463 0	1.33	В
	Overall	4th Grade	168	0.5860	1.106 5	0.53	168	0.1563	0.987 5	0.16	 0.3711	0.800 8	0.46	
		5th Grade	180	0.8246	1.039 6	0.79	180	0.8992	0.858 3	1.05	 0.8619	0.730 3	1.18	
Fairfax Elementary School	Students w/ Disabilitie s	All Grade s	42	2.0174	1.941 2	1.04	42	0.3438	1.696 0	-0.20	 0.8368	1.404 6	0.60	С
	Lowest 20%	All Grade s	86	3.1302	1.347 4	2.32	105	- 0.2722	1.076 5	-0.25	 1.4290	0.938 3	1.52	В
	Gifted	All Grade s	44	1.2969	1.846 9	-0.70	38	2.2369	1.774 1	1.26	 0.4700	1.395 3	0.34	С
		All Grade s	1,074	1.1870	0.318 7	3.72	1,073	2.6119	0.268 4	9.73	 1.8994	0.225 5	8.42	А
	Overall	6th Grade	362	2.7160	0.703 6	3.86	363	0.8700	0.593 9	1.46	 1.7930	0.495 9	3.62	
		7th Grade	355	- 0.7184	0.697 4	-1.03	354	5.0321	0.597 4	8.42	 2.1568	0.488 2	4.42	
Frank L Wiley		8th Grade	357	1.5635	0.701 0	2.23	356	1.9335	0.582 4	3.32	 1.7485	0.480 1	3.64	
Middle School	Students w/ Disabilitie s	All Grade s	138	5.0436	0.975 9	5.17	137	0.4183	0.822	0.51	 2.7310	0.685 6	3.98	А
	Lowest 20%	All Grade s	221	2.3458	0.765 4	3.06	222	2.8231	0.645 1	4.38	 2.5845	0.537 2	4.81	А
	Gifted	All Grade s	106	0.2256	1.071 0	0.21	101	2.8169	0.924 5	3.05	 1.5213	0.763 1	1.99	В
		All Grade s	1,015	1.6071	0.328 2	4.90	1,015	0.8657	0.276 0	3.14	 1.2364	0.232	5.32	А
Monticello Middle	Overall	6th Grade	339	- 1.4191	0.734 0	-1.93	339	- 0.6567	0.619 0	-1.06	 - 1.0379	0.517 2	-2.00	
School		7th Grade	338	2.2469	0.722 5	3.11	338	2.2820	0.618 3	3.69	 2.2644	0.505 8	4.48	
		8th Grade	338	3.9936	0.720 4	5.54	338	0.9718	0.596 0	1.63	 2.4827	0.492 4	5.04	

	Students w/ Disabilitie s	All Grade s	130	1.2942	1.031 6	1.25	130	0.1997	0.869 8	-0.22	 0.5473	0.725 8	0.75	С
	Lowest 20%	All Grade s	293	1.6598	0.664 4	2.50	339	0.9719	0.518 9	1.87	 1.3159	0.452 2	2.91	А
	Gifted	All Grade s	89	1.2489	1.264 4	0.99	91	0.8780	1.048 3	-0.83	 0.1855	0.883 4	0.21	С
		All Grade s	382	1.0661	0.612 5	-1.74	382	0.9678	0.538 1	-1.79	 1.0169	0.446 2	-2.27	F
	Overall	4th Grade	187	- 1.7781	1.052 2	-1.68	187	2.2051	0.933 5	2.36	 0.2135	0.759 8	0.28	
		5th Grade	195	- 0.3541	1.017 8	-0.34	195	- 4.1407	0.836 4	-4.95	 - 2.2474	0.714 0	-3.14	
Noble Elementary School	Students w/ Disabilitie s	All Grade s	48	1.6097	1.878 3	0.86	48	5.3453	1.645 3	3.25	 3.4775	1.362 4	2.55	А
	Lowest 20%	All Grade s	98	0.3758	1.284 0	0.29	110	1.1193	1.067 1	1.05	 0.7475	0.907 3	0.82	С
	Gifted	All Grade s	30	0.0456	2.283 7	-0.01	15	- 1.9728	3.110 7	-0.63	 0.6880	2.000	-0.34	С
		All Grade s	298	1.4173	0.693 8	-2.04	298	3.9323	0.614 4	-6.39	 - 2.6748	0.506 9	-5.27	F
	Overall	4th Grade	129	- 0.0152	1.267 8	-0.01	129	- 4.2544	1.126 1	-3.77	 - 2.1348	0.915 5	-2.33	
Oxford Elementary		5th Grade	169	- 2.8194	1.092 8	-2.57	169	- 3.6101	0.900 6	-4.00	 - 3.2147	0.766 9	-4.19	
School	Students w/ Disabilitie s	All Grade s	23	1.0119	2.578 9	-0.39	23	0.9198	2.233 6	0.41	 0.0460	1.861 9	-0.02	С
	Lowest 20%	All Grade s	91	1.7633	1.356 6	1.30	108	- 2.4879	1.083 0	-2.29	 0.3623	0.943 6	-0.38	С
		All Grade s	323	1.8498	0.647 8	2.86	324	1.0818	0.572 6	1.89	 1.4658	0.473 2	3.10	Α
Roxboro	Overall	4th Grade	160	1.1176	1.134 4	0.99	161	- 0.6279	1.007 0	-0.62	 0.2449	0.818 4	0.30	
Elementary School		5th Grade	163	2.5819	1.101 8	2.34	163	2.7914	0.909 8	3.07	 2.6867	0.774 1	3.47	
	Students w/ Disabilitie s	All Grade s	16	0.7839	2.505 1	0.31	16	- 2.4657	2.357 6	-1.04	 0.8409	1.899 6	-0.44	С

	Lowest 20%	All Grade s	39	1.3695	2.039 1	0.67	47	0.1199	1.618 3	0.07	 0.7447	1.416 3	0.53	С
	Gifted	All Grade s	58	4.2240	1.604 8	2.63	54	1.0717	1.467 9	0.73	 2.6479	1.185 7	2.23	А
		All Grade s	1,373	0.7899	0.282 4	2.80	1,366	1.7711	0.237 7	7.45	 1.2805	0.199 9	6.41	Α
	Overall	6th Grade	448	0.7297	0.635 4	1.15	444	0.5261	0.536 8	-0.98	 0.1018	0.447 8	0.23	
		7th Grade	462	0.3241	0.614 3	0.53	454	3.4960	0.529 4	6.60	 1.9100	0.430 7	4.44	
Roxboro		8th Grade	463	1.3160	0.619 5	2.12	468	2.3436	0.513 8	4.56	 1.8298	0.423 8	4.32	
Middle School	Students w/ Disabilitie s	All Grade s	136	1.4731	0.968 6	1.52	135	3.3544	0.820 6	4.09	 2.4137	0.684 5	3.53	А
	Lowest 20%	All Grade s	231	2.0603	0.747 3	2.76	244	1.7590	0.613 6	2.87	 1.9097	0.519 8	3.67	Α
	Gifted	All Grade s	294	0.4077	0.657 3	0.62	285	2.3377	0.564 4	4.14	 1.3727	0.466 3	2.94	Α

#### APPENDIX E. COMMERCIAL-DESIGNATED PROPERTIES IN NOBLE NEIGHBORHOOD

The following table extracted on August 24th, 2015, from the Neighborhood Stabilization Team Web Application (neocando.case.edu/nst/). Data (including Property Class and Land-use Code) come from the Cuyahoga County Fiscal Office.

DARCEI	DRODERTY CLASS	LAND LISE CODE	CENSUS
PARCEL	PROPERTY CLASS	LAND-USE CODE	TRACT
68101002	Commercial Commerc.	Apartment Building	1403.01
68103020	Exempt	Other commercial structures	1403.01
68103045	Commercial	Other commercial structures	1403.01
68106002	Commercial	General retail with walk up apartments	1403.01
68106004	Commercial	Commercial parking lot	1403.02
68106005	Commercial	Other retail structures	1403.02
68106006	Commercial	Nightclub restaurant	1403.02
68106097	Commercial	Commercial parking lot	1403.02
68106098	Commercial	Commercial parking lot	1403.02
68106121	Commercial	Commercial parking lot	1403.02
68106131	Commercial	Supermarkets	1401
68108027	Commercial	General retail with walk up apartments	1403.01
68108028	Commercial	Day care centers	1403.01
68108029	Commercial	Commercial parking lot assoc. with other use	1403.01
68108030	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1403.01
68108031	Commercial	Medical clinics and offices	1403.01
68130001	Commercial	Apartment Building	1403.02
68132043	Commercial	Other commercial structures	1403.02
68138065	Commercial	Apartment Building	1403.02
68138075	Commercial	Apartment Building	1403.02
68138076	Commercial	Apartment Building	1403.02
68138077	Commercial	Apartment Building	1403.02
68138079	Commercial	Franchise food stores	1403.02
68208014	Commercial	Auto repair garage	1401
68208016	Commercial	Supermarkets	1401
68208017	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1401
68208021	Commercial	Auto repair garage	1401

68208022	Commercial	Auto repair garage	1401
68208025	Commercial	Supermarkets	1401
68209037	Commercial	Apartment Building	1401
68210046	Commercial	Apartment Building	1401
68210056	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1401
68211038	Commercial	Apartment Building	1401
68211045	Commercial	Apartment Building	1401
68211047	Commercial	Apartment Building	1401
68211050	Commercial	Apartment Building	1401
68211052	Commercial	Apartment Building	1401
68211055	Commercial	Apartment Building	1401
68213044	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68213046	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68213052	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68213053	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68215020	Commercial	Service station with kiosk (retail)	1405
68215021	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1405
68215022	Commercial	General retail with walk up apartments	1405
68215023	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1405
68215029	Commercial	Full service gas station	1405
68218007	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68222001	Commercial	Other retail structures	1405
68222002	Commercial	Neighborhood tavern	1405
68222003	Commercial	Office buildings 1 and 2 stories	1405
68222005	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68222006	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68222007	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68222008	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68222010	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68222011	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68224001	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68224003	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68224004	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405

68224008	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68224009	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68224010	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68226012	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68226064	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68226066	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68226067	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1405
68226068	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1405
68226069	Commercial	Auto repair garage	1405
68226072	Commercial	Auto repair garage	1405
68226073	Commercial	Apartment Building	1405
68229009	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68229010	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68229011	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68229013	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68229017	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68229020	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68229021	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68229048	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68229049	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68229050	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68230001	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1404
68230043	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68230050	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68230051	Commercial	Office buildings 1 and 2 stories	1404
68230052	Commercial	General retail with walk up offices	1404
68230053	Commercial	General retail with walk up apartments	1404
68230054	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1404
68230055	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1404
68230056	Commercial	Supermarkets	1404
68230057	Commercial	Supermarkets	1404
68230058	Commercial	Supermarkets	1404
68230118	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404

68231001	Commercial	Full service gas station	1404
68231002	Commercial	Office buildings 1 and 2 stories	1404
68231129	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1404
68231130	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1404
68231131	Commercial	Franchise food stores	1404
68231133	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68231138	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68235022	Commercial	Apartment Building	1403.02
68235067	Commercial	Commercial vacant land	1404
68303001	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68303002	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68305011	Commercial	Office buildings 1 and 2 stories	1404
68305013	Commercial	Apartment Building	1404
68306009	Commercial	General retail with walk up offices	1404
68306012	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1404
68306013	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1404
68306014	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1404
68306015	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1404
68306016	Commercial	Service station with kiosk (retail)	1404
68306017	Commercial	Full service gas station	1404
68306018	Commercial	Other retail structures	1405
68306019	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1405
68306020	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1405
68306021	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1405
68306022	Commercial	General retail with walk up apartments	1405
68306029	Commercial	Auto repair garage	1405
68306030	Commercial	Auto repair garage	1405
68306031	Commercial	Auto repair garage	1405
68306032	Commercial	Self-serve car wash	1404
68306034	Commercial	General retail with walk up apartments	1404
68306042	Commercial	Auto repair garage	1404
68306050	Commercial	Savings and Ioan	1404
68306051	Commercial	Office buildings 3 or more stories (elevator)	1404

68306101	Commercial	Other retail structures	1404
68306103	Commercial	Franchise auto service center	1404
68306104	Commercial	Small (under 7500 sq. ft.) detached retail	1404

#### **APPENDIX F.** INTERVIEW STAKEHOLDERS.

Ben Faller
Bonnie Dolezal
Brenda May
Chanelle Truitt
Constance Dickerson
Constance Johnson
Cynthia Griggins
Deonna Kirkpatrick
Drew Schwanitz
Gail Larson
Helen Hertz
Herman Scott

Jeanette Carr
Joseph Nicklos
Judy Miles
Kara Hamley O'Donnell
Karen Knittel
Krista Hawthorne
Lisa Rainsong

Martha "Marty" Artzberger Nancy H. Peppler

Marcie Denton

Mark Rodney

Nick Gimmelli
Officer Quintano Mack
Paula Zinmeister
Raven Nyamwihura
Rick Wagner
Sherry Callahan
Stephen Titchenal
Steven Kanner
Susan Kaeser.

Tricia Matteo Wendy Partridge

Not listed:

Anonymous Noble Neighborhood Residents

Employees at Longwood Beauty Supply and Shell Gas Station at Noble and Monticello Roads